

COMPARATIVE STUDY ON THE FIGHT FOR LOVE IN THOMAS HARDY'S *THE WELL-BELOVED*, JOHN COLLIER'S *THE CHASER*, AND JESSE STUART'S *LOVE*

Nur Mufid¹, Akhmad Syaikh², Abdur Rohman³, Ahmad Frank⁴, Abu Fanani⁵

^{1,2,3,4,5}UIN Sunan Ampel, Indonesia

¹nurmufidali@gmail.com, ²syaikhu.aljawi@gmail.com, ³abdur_rohman@uinsa.ac.id, ⁴ahmadfrank@yahoo.com, ⁵abufanani@yahoo.com

Abstract

This study is about the fight for love in three fictions, two of which belongs to short stories, in Thomas Hardy's *the Well-Beloved*, John Collier's *the Chaser*, and Jesse Stuart's *Love*. Using the concept of romance quoted by Shumway supported by close reading as well as descriptive and dramatic approach, the study shows that the three characters in three different fictions fight for love for different importance; the former for the holy matrimony, the latter for himself, and the last for others. Whilst, the similarities go to the valuable thing they sacrifice, on one hand. On the other hand, the difference goes to sacrificing the whole life time, his valuable love, and their life, respectively. Besides, the study gives a lesson that love can be sacrificed for others and ourselves.

Key Words: well-beloved, fight for, romance theory

INTRODUCTION

Apparently, literature and comparative literature are inseparable in that as experts talk about literature, they cannot avoid of discussing comparative literature and vice versa. Accordingly, the researcher refers to Welles's suggestion that comparative literature is merely literature and to Zhirmunski's assertion that all literature is comparative literature (Jost, 1974:24). Further, Aldridge states that principally, comparative study on literature is similar to National Literature with the required condition that the number of the compared literary works is at least two (Jost, 1974:22).

Additionally, extrinsic and intrinsic aspects can be used in comparative study on literature. Extrinsic aspects refer to cultural and societal background of the author, whilst, intrinsic ones refer to philosophy, religion, psychology, sociology, history and political science (Jost, 1974:38). Sariban (2009:110) in his book *Teori Dan Penerapan Penelitian Sastra* states that literature can be related to biography, psychology and society. Hence, literature can be

studied through the author's biography, psychology, philosophy affecting his works and society where he lives. Principally, the compared works of literature have similarity in topics, conditions or elements (Miner, 1990:22) and also differences (Manlove, 1989:86).

Thus, comparative study comprises at least two works of literature and intrinsic as well as extrinsic aspects. Accordingly, the researcher refers to the intrinsic ones in Thomas Hardy's *the Well-Beloved*, John Collier's *the Chaser*, and Jesse Stuart's *love*. The first is about the main character, Jocelyn Pearson, falling in love with Avice (Avice 1). Yet, he fails. Then, he falls in love again with the daughter of Avice (Avice 2). He fails again. Then, he falls in love with the granddaughter of Avice (Avice 3). The latter is about a man who wants to get his love by coming to a magician. As the man cannot afford to pay the high price of a love potion, therefore, he gets one with low price. The last is about snakes, the she snake and the bull blacksnake that strive for the love of others. The former strives for protecting her babies from the attack, whilst, the latter for avenging his wife's death.

Because the study involves man and woman romantically connected, the researcher, then, uses romance theory stating that romances imagine the lives of individuals in terms of the natural pairing of love and marriage, or the tragic failure of this pairing (Shumway, 1999). Then, how the main characters are romantically involved as well as their comparison to one another are the focus of the study.

To get the novelty of the study, the researcher refers to first of all, Abbas (2021), in his article, the Similarity of Indonesian and British Women's Views on Marriage in the Novels Alisjahbana's *Layar Terkembang* and Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*, analyzes female's views connected to marital as well as household from two different nations. Using structuralism approach supported by feminism, the finding shows that women are to welcome matrimonial as part of the life's journey, women should not base their marriage not only on feeling but also common sense, and women get into holy matrimony due to awareness instead of men's request.

Second of all, Thoriqussuud (2024) with his study on women's betrayal comparison against the patriarchal system built the society in the two novels Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*. Using descriptive and dramatic approach, the study finds that the two women are in positive betrayal against the patriarchal system. Last of all, Kumar (2026), in his article Four Figures in Love: Anna Karenin, Emma Bovary, Constance Chatterly, and Chitralekha, discusses about four different female's attitude about love closest to the

genuine love conception. From the previous studies above, it is clear that the researcher's study has the novelty since no one uses the concept of romance quoted by Shumway above.

METHOD

Research Design

The researcher uses close reading approach in that the researcher deeply analyzes and understand the meaning. Pickering (2019) highlights that it is a must to comprehend all the text before conducting a close reading (2019). Accordingly, through close reading, the researcher disregards the life of the author, the society of the author as well as the history of the author on the issue analysis. Besides, descriptive and dramatic method plays an important role, too as the researcher would like to analyze and compare the fight for love through describing, discussing, as well as reporting the speech and action of the character.

Data Collection Technique

Because it is the study of literature, the instrument of the study, then, is the researcher himself. Further, some ways of collecting data are interview, observation, document, and survey (Miles and Huberman, 1984). Interview is not apt here as it is a literary study. Observation means to do the activity of reading to catch the issue and the related theory. Documentation means to quote and categorize the novels dealing with the fight for love. Survey means to present the interpreted data.

Data Analysis

The researcher refers to the research question and its elaboration (Miles and Huberman, 1984) in that the researcher elaborates the fight for love and compares by presenting the similarities and the differences in the aforesaid novels above.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Fighting for Love in Thomas Hardy's *the Well-Beloved*

As told above that Jocelyn Pierston has fallen in love with three girls, that is, Avice 1, the girl of the same twenty years of age as him, Avice 2, the daughter of Avice 1, when Jocelyn Pierston is in his forty years of age, and Avice 3, the granddaughter of Avice 1, when Jocelyn Pierston is in his sixty years of age, all of whom need his fight for love.

It seems that Jocelyn Pierston and Avice 1 are lovers. "Why, 'tis dear Joce!" she burst out joyfully. And running up to the young man she kissed him" (Hardy, 2000:8). Avice 1 is quite joyful as she has been separated from her lover for five years. However, Jocelyn Pierston faces a challenge in continuing his romantic affair with Avice 1, as Avice's mother does not

strongly believe in Jocelyn Pierston's loyalty to Avice 1. It can be that Jocelyn Pierston has lots of girlfriends as his money is quite sounding.

“Well, it can't be helped now. You must be careful in the future. He's got lots of young women, I'll warrant, and has few thoughts left for you. He's what they call a sculptor, and he means to be a great genius in that line someday, they do say” (Hardy, 2000:09).

Avice's mother turns out to be precise in predicting Jocelyn Pierston's heart. His love in Avice 1 fades away in that Avice 1 is no longer in his heart. He proposes to her for a marriage, though. “Will you have me as your husband?” (Hardy, 2000:11), with a negative murmur from Avice as she remembers her mother's words of his possibility of having many girlfriends. Then, Avice 1 truly abandons Jocelyn Pierston proved by the fact she gets married to her cousin. “There came a time when he learnt, through a trustworthy channel, two pieces of news affecting himself. One was the marriage of Avice Caro with her cousin” (Hardy, 2000:37).

In his forty years of age, Jocelyn Pierston falls in love with the daughter of Avice 1, that is, Avice 2. He meets Avice 2 by accident when he visits the grave of Avice 1. His romantic feeling comes again on his glim look at her. “He had no opportunity for a further study of her by distant observation, and hit upon a pretext for bringing her face to face with him” (Hardy, 2000:68).

Jocelyn Pierston is put in mind of Avice 1, his first romantic affair. Yet, Avice 2 blames him of not marrying her mother directly. To Advice 2, Jocelyn Pierston does not have valor in declaring his love in straightforward way to her mother. Her mother, then, is quite disappointed. Consequently, she gets rid of meeting him on the road though Jocelyn misses her. She gets involved in romantic affair with an army, then. Still, Jocelyn encourages himself to propose to her for a marriage (Hardy, 2000:82). Again, Jocelyn Pierston has another negative murmur now from the daughter of Advice 1, that is, Avice 2. Avice 2 turns out to marry the army secretly. “I mean he courted me, and led me on to island custom, and then I went to chapel one morning and married him in secret” (Hardy, 2000:98).

In his sixty years of age, he falls in love with the daughter of Avice 2, that is Avice 3. Likewise, the narrator opens the chapter with another romance of Jocelyn Pierston. Loving Avice 3 is like that he is cursed as he fails the previous two Avices. “He now felt that his old trouble, his doom—his curse, indeed, he had sometimes called it—was come back again.that the three Avices were interpenetrated with her essence” (Hardy, 2000:114-115). The researcher regards that Jocelyn Pierston is a very encouraging man because in his old age he

dares to express love to a girl years younger than him in spite of the fact that the girl has got direct bloodline of his two previous well-beloved, Avice 1 and Avice 2. “I hope to make the acquaintance—of your daughter,’ he said in leaving, knowing that he might have added with predestinate truth, ‘of my new tenderly-beloved” (Hardy, 2000:115). Jocelyn Pierston thinks that Avice 3 is his true love who has been there since he was a man of twenty. It is just that she moves from place to place.

“The three Avices, the second something like the first, the third a glorification of the first, at all events externally, were the outcome of the immemorial island customs of intermarriage and of prenuptial union, under which conditions the type of feature was almost uniform from parent to child through generations ...” (Hardy, 2000:118).

Jocelyn Pierston’s romantic feeling to Avice 3 is increasing. Though he is conscious that he is years older than Avice 3, which becomes unequal marriage, yet, money and social standing are things to be proud of. Accordingly, he proposes to her for a marriage. “It would set right something in my mind that has been wrong for forty years. After my death she would have plenty of freedom and plenty of means to enjoy it” (Hardy, 2000:119). The quotation shows his promises to Avice 2 that he will make Avice 3 happy though he has to be physically buried.

Without further ado, Avice 2, Avice 3’s mother, welcomes Jocelyn Pierston’s marital proposal to her daughter inasmuch as he has a good social standing and property. The researcher grows concern whether or not Avice 3 welcomes her mother’s acceptance of this proposal of marriage remembering that Jocelyn Pierston has not made a success in marrying the previous Avices, that is, her mother and her grandmother.

“She felt perfectly sure that it was the best thing she could for her girl. Not a young woman on the island but was envying Avice at that moment; for Jocelyn was absurdly young for three score, a good-looking man, one whose history was generally known here; as also were the exact figures of the fortune he had inherited from his father, and the social standing he could claim—a standing, however, which that fortune would not have been large enough to procure unassisted by his reputation in his art” (Hardy, 2000:138).

Beyond her mother’s expectation, Avice 3 marries another man, her true love, through her letter forwarded to her mother.

“Tell Mr Pierston it was not premeditated, but the result of an accident. I am sincerely sorry to have treated him with what he will think unfairness, but though I did not love him I meant to obey you and marry him. But God sent this necessity of my having to give shelter to y Love, to prevent, I think, my doing what I am now convinced would have been wrong” (Hardy, 2000:142).

The quotation shows that at first, Avic 3 welcomes the proposal of marriage from Jocelyn Pierston, but at last, she makes up her mind that she prefers her true love because of out of the blue event.

The termination of Jocelyn Pierston's romantic affair with Avic 3 turns out to be the most mournful ending as he means to marry nobody any longer from the beauty perspective. He surrenders. Rather, it is a really complete disaster in love, in chasing good looking girl.

"His life seemed no longer a professional man's experience, but a ghost story; and he would fain have vanished from his haunts on this critical afternoon, as the rest had done. He desired to sleep away his tendencies, to make something happen which would put an end to his bondage to beauty in the ideal" (Hardy, 2000:147).

Fighting for Love in John Collier's *the Chaser*

The Chaser is about a man who uses spells in getting his beloved girl by coming to a magician. The researcher regards that Alan sacrifices his pride by using spells for a girl. "Is it true," asked Alan, "that you have a certain mixture that has—er—quite extraordinary effects?" the quotation shows that love should have been fought for by Alan, yet, he takes the short cut, the magic way, the way to the researcher is not a wise way. Besides, the price of the magic spells is cheap as Alan cannot afford to buy the high one. "I hope all your mixtures are not expensive," said Alan apprehensively. Fortunately, the magician, the seller of the mixture, turns out to be a generous man.

"Oh dear, no," said the old man. "It would be no good charging that sort of price for a love potion, for example. Young people who need a love potion very seldom have five thousand dollars. Otherwise they would not need a love potion."

The quotation above shows that the price of magic spells for the well-beloved should be very high unless he puts his well-beloved lower. Accordingly, Alan sacrifices his pride-his well-beloved-for little money.

Fighting for Love in Jesse Stuart's *Love*

In this story, the characters are personified by the she snake and the bull blacksnake. It is indeed a story about, firstly, a she snake on the way to a shelter to bear the baby snakes, the eggs. However, she experiences a disaster from a farmer's dog, Collie. She stays still in the shelter instead of fighting back physically for the defense. She prefers defending her eggs to striking back to the killer. "It was snake eggs. Bob had slung them from her body. She was going to the sand heap to lay her eggs, where the sun is the setting-hen that warms them and

hatches them.” The researcher regards that the she snake fights for love for her children though she remains still in the protection area and comes to her death.

Secondly, the bull blacksnake avenges his wife, the she snake, by displaying anger to the killer. “The bull blacksnake lifted his head and followed us as we walked around the dead snake. He would have fought us to his death.” However, he is easily thrown away by his enemy, “Take a stick,” said my father, “and throw him over the hill so Bob won’t find him. Did you ever see anything to *beat that? I’ve heard they’d do that. But this is my first time to see it.” I took a stick and threw him over the bank into the dewy sprouts on the cliff.” The quotation shows that the bull blacksnake fights for love for his wife though he has to die

THE SIMILARITIES AND THE DIFFERENCES

From the findings above, the researcher comes to the discussion through presenting the similarities and the differences. As to the similarities, all the characters have sacrificed his life. Jocelyn Pierston has sacrificed his whole life time just for having Avice, his well-beloved. From the marriage of Avice 1, he has to wait for twenty years for the coming of Avice 2, the daughter of his well-beloved Avice 1. Like her mother, Avice 2 rejects his love recollecting that her mother was made upset by Jocelyn. Then, Jocelyn has to wait for another twenty years for the love of the coming descendant of Avice 1, that is, Avice 3. Indeed, the mother of Avice 3, namely, Avice 2 agrees with Jocelyn’s proposal of a marriage to Avice 3, however, Avice 3 has her own true love. Therefore, in his sixty age year after the rejection of the marital proposal by Avice 3, Jocelyn Pierston gives up another proposal of marriage. “He desired to sleep away his tendencies, to make something happen which would put an end to his bondage to beauty in the ideal” (Hardy, 2000:147). Thus, Jocelyn Pierston has sacrificed his valuable thing, that is, his long time for his well-beloved.

Likewise, Alan has sacrificed a valuable thing, namely, love. Love should not be compared to material possession in this world. But Alan gives no appreciation to a girl he loves by conquering her through cheap spells. He should have sacrificed everything for his love. Instead of sacrificing himself, he sacrifices his love for little money. “It would be no good charging that sort of price for a love potion, for example. Young people who need a love potion very seldom have five thousand dollars. Otherwise they would not need a love potion.” Thus, Alan sacrifices his valuable one, love.

The she snake and the bull blacksnake sacrifice their valuable things for their love. The former lets herself die for the survival of the off springs, whilst, the latter lets himself die

avenging his well-beloved, the wife. “The bull blacksnake lifted his head and followed us as we walked around the dead snake. He would have fought us to his death.” Thus, both characters, the she snake and the bull blacksnake die for their well-beloved.

All in all, the similarity of fight for love in the three fictions falls on their sacrifice of the valuable thing. To make a clear cut understanding, the researcher puts the similarity in the table as follows:

The Similarity of the Fight for Love

The Well-beloved	The Chaser	Love
All the characters sacrifice their valuable thing		

As to the differences, the character in *the Well-Beloved* sacrifices his whole time for the love of Avices. Failing to get the first Avice, he has to wait for twenty years. Failing again for the second Avice, he has to wait again for another twenty years for the third Avice. Then, he stops. “His life seemed no longer a professional man’s experience, but a ghost story” (Hardy, 2000:147). It means that his whole life time scares him. He has nothing for the long journey of waiting.

The character in *the Chaser* sacrifices his love for little money. To the common understanding love is worth more than anything. However, Alan puts aside his love by little money in that to get his true love, he has to spend little money. It is an embarrassment for love. Love should be worth more than that. “I hope all your mixtures are not expensive” shows that Alan sacrifices the value of love instead of sacrificing himself for love.

The characters in *Love* sacrifice their life for their love. The she snake and the bull blacksnake die for their love. The former protects the baby snakes, whilst, the bull blacksnake avenges the she snake, the wife. “Take a stick,” said my father, “and throw him over the hill so Bob won’t find him. Did you ever see anything to *beat that? I’ve heard they’d do that. But this is my first time to see it.” This quotation shows that the bull blacksnake sacrifices his life for the one he loves.

In a nutshell, the differences of the fight for love in the three fictions run thus: sacrificing his whole life time in *the Well-Beloved*, the value of love in *the Chaser*, and a life in *Love*. To make a clear cut understanding, the researcher puts in the table as follows:

The Difference of the Fight for Love

The Well-Beloved	The Chaser	Love
Sacrificing the whole life time	Sacrificing love	Sacrificing life

CONCLUSION

From the finding and the discussion above, the researcher comes to conclude love is worthy of anything. In the first fiction, the main character his valuable time, namely, whole life one that should be managed not only for the love for woman but also for other thing, science for example. In the second fiction, the main character sacrifices his valuable one, love itself. He should have sacrificed more for his well-beloved. He affords priceless to it, instead. In the third fiction, both main characters sacrifice their life for their well-beloved. It means that love is worth fight for all out. It also gives the researcher a lesson that love can be sacrificed for others and for ourselves. Besides, the researcher is in a considerable hope that there are researchers conducting study on the same fictions with different approach or on the different fictions with the same approach in order that the study of literature develops rapidly.

REFERENCES

- Abbas (2021). The Similarity of Indonesian and British Women's Views on Marriage in the Novels Alisjahbana's *Layar Terkembang* and Austen's *Pride And Prejudice*, *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference of Linguistics and Culture*. URL: <https://www.atlantis-press.com/proceedings/iclc-2-21/125967690>
- Collier, John. 2012. *the Chaser*, Lecturer's materials, Unpublished, Surabaya.
- Hardy, Thomas. 2000. *The Well-Beloved*, Wordsworth Editions Limited Cumberland House, Crib Street, Ware, Hertfordshire.
- Huberman, et. al. 1984. *Innovation Up Close, How School Improvement Works*. Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
- Jost, Francois, 1974. *Introduction to Comparative Literature*, Indianapolis and New York: Pegasus: Division of The Bobbs-Merril Company, Inc.
- Kumar, Prem. "FOUR FIGURES IN LOVE: ANNA KARENIN, EMMA BOVARY, CONSTANCE CHATTERLY, AND CHITRALEKHA; a Comparative Study." *Journal of South Asian Literature*, vol. 12, no. 3/4, 1977, pp. 73–80. JSTOR, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40872156>.
- Manlove, Colin, 1989. *Critical Thinking, A Guide to Interpreting Literary Texts*, New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Miner, Earl, 1990. *Comparative Poetics*, Princeton, New York: Princeton University Press
- Pickering, S. (2019). Close Reading. In *Dreamtime* (pp. 92–97). <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv6wggx8.14>

- Sariban, 2009. *Teori Dan Penerapan Penelitian Sastra*, Surabaya: Lentera Cendekia.
- Shumway, David R. 1999. Romance in the Romance: Love and Marriage, *Journal of Narrative Theory*, Volume 29, Number 1, Winter 1999, pp. 110-134. Published by Eastern Michigan University. DOI: 10.1353/jnt.2011.0087
- Stuart, Jesse, *Love*, Lecturer's Materials, Unpublished, Surabaya, 2012.
- Thoriqussuud, M., Rohim, F., Fanani, A., Syaikh, A., and Romdlon, A. (2024). A Comparative Study on Women's Betrayal In Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *The Patience Stone*, *Edulitics Journal*, 09 (02), 103-111. URL: <https://ejurnal.unisda.ac.id/index.php/edulitic/article/view/7258>